Kaempfer & Associates, Inc.
Consulting Engineers
650 East Jackson St. P.O. Box 150
Oconto Falls, Wisconsin 54154
(920) 846-3932 Fax (920) 846-8319

March 14, 2013 E145-08.06

Mr. Mark Radtke, P.E., Director of Public Works
City of Menasha
140 Main Street
Menasha, WI 54952-3190

Re: Ninth Street Sewage Lift Station Improvements
Bid Award Recommendation

Dear Mr. Radtke:

On Tuesday, March 12, 2013 at 2:00 p.m., bids for the Ninth Street Sewage Lift Station Improvements, Contract E145-13-01A for Sewage Lift Station Modifications and Contract E145-13-01B for Sewage Force Main Replacement were opened and read. A total of eleven (11) bids were received from ten (10) Contractors. Two (2) bids were received for Contract E145-13-01A and nine (9) bids were received for Contract E145-13-01B. All of the Contractors who received plans and specifications and were prequalified by the City submitted a bid.

The two (2) bids received for Contract E145-13-01A, Sewage Lift Station Modifications, were as follows:

Contractor	Total Bid
PTS Contractors, Inc.	$298,875.00
Advance Construction, Inc.	$325,010.00

The proposal schedule for Contract E145-13-01A did not contain any optional work items. The proposal schedule for Contract E145-13-01A contained two substitute optional work items. Substitute Optional Bid Item O-1A is for removing and replacing the existing sewage lift station shown on the drawings with a USEMCO below grade flooded suction pumping station. Bid Items 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A, and 7A would be eliminated if Substitute Optional Bid Item O-1A is selected. Substitute Optional Bid Item O-1A would decrease the contract amount of the low bidder for Sewage Lift Station Modifications by $22,275.00. We recommend that Substitute Optional Bid Item O-1A be included in the Sewage Lift Station Modifications contract.

Substitute Optional Bid Item O-2A is for removing and replacing the existing sewage lift station shown on the drawings with a Smith & Loveless below grade flooded suction pumping station. Smith & Loveless was unable to provide a quotation and supporting information to the Contractors for Substitute Optional Bid Item O-2A. As a result, the Contractors did not provide a bid for Substitute Optional Bid Item O-2A.

No Contractors offered proposed alternatives for the Sewage Lift Station Modifications contract.

The nine (9) bids received for Contract E145-13-01B, Sewage Force Main Replacement, were as follows:

Contractor	Total Bid
Roger Bowers Construction, Inc.	$194,066.35
David Tenor Corporation	$196,106.60
Donald Hietpas & Sons, Inc.	$203,702.56
Carl Bowers & Sons Construction Co., Inc.	$212,400.00
DeGroot, Inc.	$220,906.37
VanStraten Construction Co., Inc.	$232,620.00
PTS Contractors, Inc.	$241,523.20
Feaker & Sons Co., Inc.	$246,699.00
Dorner Inc.	$327,175.00

The proposal schedule for Contract E145-13-01B did not contain any optional work items or substitute optional work items. No Contractors offered proposed alternatives for the Sewage Force Main Replacement contract.

One (1) combined bid was received for Contracts E145-13-01A and E145-13-01B. The low combined bid of $540,398.20 from PTS Contractors, Inc. was $47,456.85 higher than the sum of the low bids from PTS Contractors, Inc. for Contract E145-13-01A and Roger Bowers Construction, Inc. for Contract E145-13-01B. The combined bid will not affect the low bidders for Contracts E145-13-01A and E145-13-01B. We recommend that the combined bid not be considered.

A copy of the bid tabulation, which includes details of the unit price work items, is attached for your information. The bid tabulation reflects the amounts after all corrections have been made. Two (2) addenda were issued during the bidding process. All of the Contractors acknowledged receipt of Addendum No. 1 and Addendum No. 2. All bidders whose proposals were received were prequalified by the City of Menasha.

The Engineer's estimate for the project, based on the final design, was:

Contract E145-13-01A, Sewage Lift Station Modifications	$170,200.00
Contract E145-13-01B, Sewage Force Main Replacement	$320,849.00
TOTAL	$491,049.00

The sum of the low bids was one percent (1%) higher than the Engineer's estimate. We are of the opinion that bidding on the project was very competitive due to the closeness of the bids and the number of bidders.

All proposals were signed and notarized and were submitted with a bid bond for five percent (5%) of the bid amount. The following irregularities were found when the bids were reviewed:

1. PTS Contractors, Inc. did not provide complete addresses for Proposed Subcontractors for Contract E145-13-01A. PTS Contractors, Inc. provided names of more than one manufacturer and supplier on the Proposed Equipment and Material List for Contract E145-13-01B. PTS Contractors, Inc. failed to provide complete addresses for Proposed Subcontractors for Contract E145-13-01B. PTS Contractors, Inc. failed to properly complete the Disadvantaged Business Enterprise Program (DBE) Subcontractor Utilization Form.

2. Advance Construction, Inc. provided a total bid for Contract E145-13-01A written in figures for Bid Items 1A through 8A as $325,010.00. The total of Bid Items 1A through 8A did not equal the amount listed for their bid. The total cost for Bid Item 8A has been adjusted for the math error. The total cost for Bid Item 8A is $50,500.00. Advance Construction, Inc. provided a total cost for Substitute Optional Bid Item O-1A written in words as "one hundred seventy nine thousand + 00/100" and written in figures as $175,000.00. Advance Construction, Inc. failed to provide complete addresses for Proposed Subcontractors. Advance Construction, Inc. failed to properly complete the Disadvantaged Business Enterprise Program (DBE) Subcontractor Utilization Form. Advance Construction, Inc. did not provide typed name for the signature block on the Bid Bond.

3. Roger Bowers Construction, Inc. provided names of more than one manufacturer on the Proposed Equipment and Material List. Roger Bowers Construction, Inc. did not provide name or address for the Terrace and Lawn Restoration Subcontractor. Roger Bowers Construction, Inc. failed to properly complete the Disadvantaged Business Enterprise Program (DBE) Subcontractor Utilization Form. Roger Bowers Construction, Inc. did not provide typed name or title for the signature block on the Bid Bond. The bonding company did not provide a city and state for the Attorney-in-Fact on the Bid Bond for Roger Bowers Construction, Inc.

4. David Tenor Corporation did not have a correct total cost due to an addition/math error. The total cost for Contract E145-13-01B was listed as $196,124.60. The correct total cost for Contract E145-13-01B is $196,106.60. David Tenor Corporation provided names of more than one manufacturer on the Proposed Equipment and Material List. David Tenor Corporation failed to properly complete the Disadvantaged Business Enterprise Program (DBE) Subcontractor Utilization Form. David Tenor Corporation did not provide typed name or title for the signature block on the Bid Bond.

5. Donald Hietpas & Sons, Inc. did not have a correct total cost for Bid Item 20B due to a multiplication error. The total cost for Bid Item 20B was listed as $5,100.00. The correct total cost for Bid Item 20B is $4,641.00. This error did not affect the total bid amount. Donald Hietpas & Sons, Inc. provided names of more than one manufacturer and supplier on the Proposed Equipment and Material List. Donald Hietpas & Sons, Inc. failed to properly complete the Disadvantaged Business Enterprise Program (DBE) Subcontractor Utilization Form. Donald Hietpas & Sons, Inc. did not provide typed name for the signature block on the Bid Bond.

6. Carl Bowers & Sons Construction Co., Inc. did not have a correct total cost for Bid Item 11B due to a multiplication error. The total cost for Bid Item 11B was listed as $2,440.00. The correct total cost for Bid Item 11B is $2,240.00. The total cost for Contract E145-13-01B was incorrect due to this error. The correct total cost for Contract E145-13-01B is $212,400.00. Carl Bowers & Sons Construction Co., Inc. provided names of more than one manufacturer on the Proposed Equipment and Material List. Carl Bowers & Sons Construction Co., Inc. failed to provide addresses for Proposed Subcontractors. Carl Bowers & Sons Construction Co., Inc. did not provide typed name for the signature block on the Bid Bond.

7. DeGroot, Inc. provided a total sum written in words as "Two hundred twenty thousand nine hundred Six + 37/100" and written in figures as $228,571.37 for Contract E145-13-01B. The total cost for Bid Items 1B through 21B is $220,906.37. The correct total cost for Contract E145-13-01B is $220,906.37. DeGroot, Inc. failed to provide addresses for Proposed Subcontractors. DeGroot, Inc. did not provide a name or address for the Terrace and Lawn Restoration Subcontractor. DeGroot, Inc. did not provide a typed name or title for the signature block on the Bid Bond.

8. VanStraten Construction Co., Inc. provided names of more than one manufacturer on the Proposed Equipment and Material List. VanStraten Construction Co., Inc. failed to provide name or address for the Terrace and Lawn Restoration Subcontractor.

9. Feaker & Sons Co., Inc. provided names of more than one manufacturer on the Proposed Equipment and Material List. Feaker & Sons Co., Inc. failed to provide complete addresses for Proposed Subcontractors.

10. Dorner Inc. provided names of more than one manufacturer on the Proposed Equipment and Material List. Dorner Inc. did not provide a typed name for the signature block on the Bid Bond.

We are of the opinion that the irregularities are not significant and should be waived.

Based on our review of the bids, we recommend that Contract E145-13-01A, Sewage Lift Station Modifications, be awarded to PTS Contractors, Inc. of Green Bay, Wisconsin for the amount of $276,600.00. The contract amount will include replacing Bid Items 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A, and 7A with Substitute Optional Bid Item O-1A.

Base Bid	$298,875.00
Delete Bid Item 1A	($ 2,075.00)
Delete Bid Item 2A	($ 30,600.00)
Delete Bid Item 3A	($ 7,100.00)
Delete Bid Item 4A	($105,500.00)
Delete Bid Item 5A	($ 6,000.00)
Delete Bid Item 7A	($ 11,000.00)
Add Substitute Optional Bid Item O-1A	$140,000.00
TOTAL	$276,600.00

Based on our review of the bids, we recommend that Contract E145-13-01B, Sewage Force Main Replacement, be awarded to Roger Bowers Construction, Inc. of Kaukauna, Wisconsin for the amount of $194,066.35.

The total of both contracts to be awarded is $470,666.35. Please contact Jeff Wolford or me if you have any questions or need additional information.

Sincerely,

KAEMPFER & ASSOCIATES, INC.

Taryn S. Nall, P.E.

TSN:jlb

Enc: Bid Tabulation

Bid Tabulation
Ninth Street Sewage Lift Station Improvements
Contract No. E145-13-01
City of Menasha

Bid Date: March 12, 2013
Engineer: Kaempfer & Associates, Inc.

Contractor	E145-13-01A Sewage Lift Station Modifications	E145-13-01B Sewage Force Main Replacement	Combined Bid	Bid Bond
PTS Contractors, Inc.	$298,875.00	$241,523.20	$540,398.20	5%
Advance Construction, Inc.	$325,010.00	--	--	5%
Roger Bowers Construction, Inc.	--	$194,066.35	--	5%
David Tenor Corporation	--	$196,106.60	--	5%
Donald Hietpas & Sons, Inc.	--	$203,702.56	--	5%
Carl Bowers & Sons Construction Co., Inc.	--	$212,400.00	--	5%
DeGroot, Inc.	--	$220,906.37	--	5%
VanStraten Construction Co., Inc.	--	$232,620.00	--	5%
Feaker & Sons Co., Inc.	--	$246,699.00	--	5%
Dorner Inc.	--	$327,175.00	--	5%
Engineer's Estimate	$170,200.00	$320,849.00		

NINTH STREET SEWAGE LIFT STATION IMPROVEMENTS
Contract E145-13-01A
City of Menasha, Winnebago County, Wisconsin
March 12, 2013

Item No.	Description	Contractors: PTS Contractors, Inc. Total Cost	Contractors: Advance Construction Inc. Total Cost	Engineer's Estimate Total Cost
1A	Provide sewage lift station stair modifications	$2,075.00	$2,660.00	$3,200.00
2A	Remove equipment, prepare surfaces, and paint inerior and exterior exposed steel surfaces	$30,600.00	$39,200.00	$37,000.00
3A	Provide Type "B" premium efficiency inverter duty motors	$7,100.00	$14,000.00	$6,000.00
4A	Provide raw sewage pump variable frequency drive, primary and secondary control systems, electrical and control panel, and electrical and control work	$105,500.00	$95,000.00	$45,000.00
5A	Provide pump suction elbows and sewage lift station ancillary systems, as specified in Article C11.04	$6,000.00	$16,100.00	$18,500.00
6A	Provide 6-inch diameter ductile iron raw sewage suction pipelines	$81,100.00	$100,000.00	$22,500.00
7A	Provide cathodic protection system	$11,000.00	$7,550.00	$10,000.00
8A	Provide all other work for modification of the Ninth Street Sewage Lift Station	$55,500.00	$50,500.00	$28,000.00
	TOTAL, Items 1A through 8A	$298,875.00	$325,010.00	$170,200.00
	SUBSTITUTE OPTIONAL WORK ITEMS			
	The bidder shall provide a price for the substitute optional work items for the Owner's consideration. The substitute optional work item to be used shall be selected by the Owner. Substiute Optional Bid Item O-1A or Substitute Optional Bid Item O-2A may be substituted for Bid Items 1A, 2A, 3A, 4A, 5A, and 7A. The Bidder shall attach submittal information for each Substitute Optional Bid Item. The submittal information shall include preliminary design drawings showing the dimensions, details of enclosure construction and layout of the sewage lift station, data sheets for the equipment and systems to be provided; pump performance curves; details on cathodic protection system; details on electrical components and equipment control panel; and details on the ancillary equipment. The Bidder shall attach a delivery schedule for each Substitute Optional Bid Item that includes shop drawing development and review, fabrication, and delivery of the sewage lift station.			
O-1A	Remove and replace the existing sewage lift station shown on the drawings with a USEMCO below grade flooded suction pumping station	$140,000.00	$175,000.00	$140,000.00
O-2A	Remove and replace the existing sewage lift station shown on the drawings with a Smith & Loveless below graded flooded suction pumping station	No Bid	No Bid	$140,000.00

NINTH STREET SEWAGE LIFT STATION IMPROVEMENTS
Contract E145-13-01B
City of Menasha, Winnebago County, Wisconsin
March 12, 2013

Item No.		Description	Contractors									
			Roger Bowers Cons. Inc.		David Tenor Construction		Donald Hietpas & Sons, Inc.		Carl Bowers & Sons Constr.		DeGroot Inc.	
			Unit Price	Total Cost	Unit Price	Total Cost	Unit Price	Total Cost	Unit Price	Total Cost	Unit Price	Total Cost
1B	1	-each mobilization and demobilization for Contract E145-13-01B, including other general conditions	$1,000.00	$1,000.00	$2,000.00	$2,000.00	$1,000.00	$1,000.00	$502.00	$502.00	$6,464.00	$6,464.00
2B	1	-each traffic control for duration of the project	$3,500.00	$3,500.00	$8,550.00	$8,550.00	$7,575.00	$7,575.00	$8,000.00	$8,000.00	$9,000.00	$9,000.00
3B	2,152	-lineal feet of 8-inch PVC SFM pipeline replacement with granular backfill	$45.00	$96,840.00	$46.50	$100,068.00	$44.75	$96,302.00	$50.00	$107,600.00	$43.62	$93,870.24
4B	120	-lineal feet of 8-inch PVC SFM pipeline replacement with aggregate slurry backfill	$180.00	$21,600.00	$114.00	$13,680.00	$141.80	$17,016.00	$130.00	$15,600.00	$120.05	$14,406.00
5B	688	-lineal feet of 8-inch PVC SFM pipeline replacement with engineered backfill	$34.00	$23,392.00	$34.00	$23,392.00	$31.87	$21,926.56	$50.00	$34,400.00	$29.28	$20,144.64
6B	1	-each connection of 8-inch SFM to existing 6-inch SFM at Sewage Lift Station, including 8-inch x 6-inch reducer and 6-inch solid sleeve	$900.00	$900.00	$1,350.00	$1,350.00	$1,500.00	$1,500.00	$1,500.00	$1,500.00	$2,393.84	$2,393.84
7B	1	-each 8-inch $^1/_4$ SFM bend	$250.00	$250.00	$380.00	$380.00	$300.00	$300.00	$300.00	$300.00	$615.91	$615.91
8B	8	-each 8-inch $^1/_8$ SFM bend	$250.00	$2,000.00	$275.00	$2,200.00	$300.00	$2,400.00	$300.00	$2,400.00	$698.62	$5,588.96
9B	1	-each 8-inch $^1/_{32}$ SFM bend	$200.00	$200.00	$360.00	$360.00	$300.00	$300.00	$300.00	$300.00	$587.94	$587.94
10B	4	-each tracer wire access riser	$250.00	$1,000.00	$300.00	$1,200.00	$650.00	$2,600.00	$250.00	$1,000.00	$231.72	$926.88
11B	448	-square feet of 2-inch frost protection rigid insulation	$2.00	$896.00	$3.00	$1,344.00	$2.75	$1,232.00	$5.00	$2,240.00	$3.03	$1,357.44
12B	1	-each emergency force main connection including bypass connection riser, three (3) resilient-seated gate valves, fittings, piping, and connection to Manhole No. 855, as shown on Drawing P4	$7,500.00	$7,500.00	$5,700.00	$5,700.00	$8,600.00	$8,600.00	$1,500.00	$1,500.00	$11,547.66	$11,547.66
13B	1	-each discharge manhole and appurtenances	$4,247.00	$4,247.00	$3,750.00	$3,750.00	$5,275.00	$5,275.00	$4,000.00	$4,000.00	$9,806.87	$9,806.87
14B	1	-each air release valve manhole and appurtenances, as shown on Drawing P3	$6,500.00	$6,500.00	$7,800.00	$7,800.00	$8,300.00	$8,300.00	$6,000.00	$6,000.00	$8,635.83	$8,635.83
15B	600	-square feet of concrete pavement restoration	$6.50	$3,900.00	$6.57	$3,942.00	$5.75	$3,450.00	$6.00	$3,600.00	$14.32	$8,592.00
16B	56	-tons of E-1 19mm bituminous concrete pavement roadway and apron restoration	$98.85	$5,535.60	$90.00	$5,040.00	$150.00	$8,400.00	$110.00	$6,160.00	$156.55	$8,766.80
17B	25	-tons of E-1 12.5mm bituminous concrete pavement roadway and apron restoration	$108.47	$2,711.75	$100.00	$2,500.00	$150.00	$3,750.00	$130.00	$3,250.00	$156.55	$3,913.75
18B	1,200	-each square yards of terrace and lawn restoration	$2.50	$3,000.00	$4.32	$5,184.00	$4.25	$5,100.00	$5.00	$6,000.00	$4.55	$5,460.00
19B	1,092	-square feet of concrete driveway apron retoration	$4.50	$4,914.00	$4.55	$4,968.60	$4.25	$4,641.00	$4.00	$4,368.00	$5.73	$6,257.16
20B	60	-lineal feet of curb and gutter restoration	$28.00	$1,680.00	$28.30	$1,698.00	$36.00	$2,160.00	$28.00	$1,680.00	$32.32	$1,939.20
21B	25	-each inlet protection	$100.00	$2,500.00	$40.00	$1,000.00	$75.00	$1,875.00	$80.00	$2,000.00	$25.25	$631.25
TOTAL, Items 1B through 21B				$194,066.35		$196,106.60		$203,702.56		$212,400.00		$220,906.37

NINTH STREET SEWAGE LIFT STATION IMPROVEMENTS
Contract E145-13-01B
City of Menasha, Winnebago County, Wisconsin
March 12, 2013

Item No.		Description	Contractors								Engineer's Estimate	
			VanStraten Constr. Co. Inc.		PTS Contractors, Inc.		Feaker & Sons Co., Inc.		Dorner Inc.			
			Unit Price	Total Cost	Unit Price	Total Cost	Unit Price	Total Cost	Unit Price	Total Cost	Unit Price	Total Cost
1B	1	-each mobilization and demobilization for Contract E145-13-01B, including other general conditions	$12,000.00	$12,000.00	$7,980.00	$7,980.00	$6,960.00	$6,960.00	$12,500.00	$12,500.00	$15,000.00	$15,000.00
2B	1	-each traffic control for duration of the project	$7,000.00	$7,000.00	$8,650.00	$8,650.00	$9,500.00	$9,500.00	$10,000.00	$10,000.00	$9,500.00	$9,500.00
3B	2,152	-lineal feet of 8-inch PVC SFM pipeline replacement with granular backfill	$49.00	$105,448.00	$58.00	$124,816.00	$56.00	$120,512.00	$75.00	$161,400.00	$75.00	$161,400.00
4B	120	-lineal feet of 8-inch PVC SFM pipeline replacement with aggregate slurry backfill	$55.00	$6,600.00	$114.15	$13,698.00	$100.00	$12,000.00	$210.00	$25,200.00	$125.00	$15,000.00
5B	688	-lineal feet of 8-inch PVC SFM pipeline replacement with engineered backfill	$40.00	$27,520.00	$34.70	$23,873.60	$36.00	$24,768.00	$40.00	$27,520.00	$70.00	$48,160.00
6B	1	-each connection of 8-inch SFM to existing 6-inch SFM at Sewage Lift Station, including 8-inch x 6-inch reducer and 6-inch solid sleeve	$4,900.00	$4,900.00	$1,470.00	$1,470.00	$3,300.00	$3,300.00	$5,000.00	$5,000.00	$500.00	$500.00
7B	1	-each 8-inch $^1/_4$ SFM bend	$500.00	$500.00	$295.00	$295.00	$290.00	$290.00	$250.00	$250.00	$700.00	$700.00
8B	8	-each 8-inch $^1/_8$ SFM bend	$500.00	$4,000.00	$277.00	$2,216.00	$270.00	$2,160.00	$230.00	$1,840.00	$600.00	$4,800.00
9B	1	-each 8-inch $^1/_{32}$ SFM bend	$400.00	$400.00	$268.00	$268.00	$260.00	$260.00	$225.00	$225.00	$500.00	$500.00
10B	4	-each tracer wire access riser	$500.00	$2,000.00	$395.00	$1,580.00	$325.00	$1,300.00	$225.00	$900.00	$200.00	$800.00
11B	448	-square feet of 2-inch frost protection rigid insulation	$2.00	$896.00	$2.40	$1,075.20	$3.00	$1,344.00	$3.75	$1,680.00	$4.00	$1,792.00
12B	1	-each emergency force main connection including bypass connection riser, three (3) resilient-seated gate valves, fittings, piping, and connection to Manhole No. 855, as shown on Drawing P4	$8,000.00	$8,000.00	$9,500.00	$9,500.00	$10,000.00	$10,000.00	$12,500.00	$12,500.00	$9,700.00	$9,700.00
13B	1	-each discharge manhole and appurtenances	$8,750.00	$8,750.00	$6,050.00	$6,050.00	$8,000.00	$8,000.00	$10,000.00	$10,000.00	$7,500.00	$7,500.00
14B	1	-each air release valve manhole and appurtenances, as shown on Drawing P3	$11,000.00	$11,000.00	$10,600.00	$10,600.00	$11,000.00	$11,000.00	$13,000.00	$13,000.00	$12,500.00	$12,500.00
15B	600	-square feet of concrete pavement restoration	$14.00	$8,400.00	$7.30	$4,380.00	$8.00	$4,800.00	$18.00	$10,800.00	$20.00	$12,000.00
16B	56	-tons of E-1 19mm bituminous concrete pavement roadway and apron restoration	$100.00	$5,600.00	$103.00	$5,768.00	$153.00	$8,568.00	$115.00	$6,440.00	$70.00	$3,920.00
17B	25	-tons of E-1 12.5mm bituminous concrete pavement roadway and apron restoration	$110.00	$2,750.00	$109.00	$2,725.00	$153.00	$3,825.00	$125.00	$3,125.00	$70.00	$1,750.00
18B	1,200	-each square yards of terrace and lawn restoration	$5.00	$6,000.00	$5.40	$6,480.00	$7.15	$8,580.00	$7.50	$9,000.00	$4.50	$5,400.00
19B	1,092	-square feet of concrete driveway apron retoration	$5.50	$6,006.00	$5.20	$5,678.40	$6.00	$6,552.00	$10.00	$10,920.00	$6.00	$6,552.00
20B	60	-lineal feet of curb and gutter restoration	$60.00	$3,600.00	$42.00	$2,520.00	$33.00	$1,980.00	$50.00	$3,000.00	$25.00	$1,500.00
21B	25	-each inlet protection	$50.00	$1,250.00	$76.00	$1,900.00	$40.00	$1,000.00	$75.00	$1,875.00	$75.00	$1,875.00
TOTAL, Items 1B through 21B				$232,620.00		$241,523.20		$246,699.00		$327,175.00		$320,849.00