



MEMORANDUM

TO: Administration Committee

FROM: Pamela A. Captain, CA/HR

SUBJECT: Vision Insurance

DATE: Thursday, September 02, 2010

On July 7th, the City received a renewal notice from Vision Insurance Plan of America, Inc. (VIPA), extending the current rates for another 36 months. On July 19, this Committee reviewed the renewal request and asked staff to get other quotes. This request was forwarded to The Horton Group which provides insurance brokerage services to the City of Menasha. Horton requested quotations from AlwaysCare, Epic Life and Vision Service Plan.

The Horton Group provides a status below:

AlwaysCare - provided very competitive rates, but their standard plan includes a \$10 copayment for materials (glasses), whereas the City's current plan does not have a copayment for materials. Their network is similar to VIPA, and includes Target, ShopKo, Wal-Mart and a number of others. AlwaysCare provided a 2-year rate guarantee, whereas the rates provided by VIPA are guaranteed for three (3) years. There is the possibility that they can request AlwaysCare management approval to waive the copayment, but this would increase their quoted rates.

Vision Service Plan - Declined to issue a quotation.

Epic Life - The Epic proposal that most closely matched the City's benefit design is more expensive than the current/renewal rates provided by Vision Insurance Plan of America. In addition, the Epic Life plan requires a \$25 copayment on materials, whereas no copayment would apply for the City currently. If Epic Life were to remove this copayment, this would further increase their rates.

VIPA's rates have been very stable, and the City was able to increase benefits in 2009. Given the employee's familiarity with the current plan and network providers and the renewal at current rates for an additional 3 years, Horton recommends that the City renew with VIPA.